## Stock Assessment

## Rock Cod

Patagonotothen ramsayi


Andreas Winter

Natural Resources - Fisheries
Falkland Islands Government Stanley, Falkland Islands

March 2021


Winter, A. 2021. Rock cod (Patagonotothen ramsayi) stock assessment. SA-2021-PAR. Fisheries Department, Directorate of Natural Resources, Falkland Islands Government, Stanley, Falkland Islands. 29 p.

## © Crown Copyright 2021

No part of this publication may be reproduced without prior permission from the Falkland Islands Government Fisheries Department.

## Acknowledgements

We thank the captains and crews of the commercial fishing vessels, and the scientific observers of the Falkland Islands Fisheries Department that facilitated and assisted in catch and biological data collection.

Distribution: Public Domain

Reviewed and approved 2 March 2021

## Table of Contents

Summary ..... 1
Introduction ..... 2
Methods. ..... 3
Category 3 ..... 3
LBI. ..... 4
Results ..... 6
Catches ..... 6
Category 3 ..... 6
LBI. ..... 7
Conclusion ..... 10
References ..... 13
Appendix ..... 16

# Rock cod (Patagonotothen ramsayi) stock assessment 

Andreas Winter*<br>Fisheries Department, Directorate of Natural Resources, Falkland Islands Government, Bypass Road, Stanley FIQQ 1ZZ, Falkland Islands<br>*AWinter@fisheries.gov.fk

## Summary

Annual rock cod commercial catches and survey catches decreased in 2020 for respectively the sixth and fifth straight years. Following recommendations of the MacAlister Elliott \& Partners external review, total allowable catch (TAC) calculation was revised according to the ICES category $3-2 / 3$ rule for biomass indices, but constrained by a maximum of the average of the last three years' catches. The rock cod TAC for 2022 is accordingly set at 1266.0 tonnes.

Length-based indicators suggest that maximum sustainable yield is being achieved in the current finfish fishery, but conservation outcomes for immature and large rock cods are not clearly positive. Rock cod lengths at $50 \%$ adulthood have significantly decreased since about 2000. Median lengths have also decreased, but length distribution sampling in the fishery may be influenced by the recent decline of rock cod to commercial bycatch status.

## Introduction

Rock cod Patagonotothen ramsayi (Regan) is a medium-sized benthopelagic species inhabiting the shelf edge and upper slope of the Falkland Islands (Brickle et al. 2006a, Laptikhovsky et al. 2013), where part of the total stock migrates mainly in spring and summer (Arkhipkin et al. 2012). Rock cod has long been a major bycatch component of Falkland trawl fisheries (Brickle et al. 2006a, La Mesa et al. 2016), as predators of rock cod are commercially important species such as toothfish, kingclip, hakes, and skates (Arkhipkin et al. 2003, Brickle et al. 2003, Nyegaard et al. 2004, Brickle et al. 2006b). Rock cod are also known to scavenge trawl discards (Laptikhovsky and Arkhipkin 2003), resulting in further overlap with the fisheries.


Figure 1. Annual commercial catches of rock cod and other major groundfish target species from FIFD catch reports, since 1987. Category 'other' is catch reported as such; i.e. unidentified species, not a pooled category of identified species. Rock cod (out) are rock cod caught outside the Falkland Islands conservation zones but reported to the FIFD (as required for Falkland-flagged vessels), and entered in the database as licence category "O". Hake, hoki, and blue whiting are totalled irrespective of licence category. Hake includes Merluccius hubbsi and the rarer Merluccius australis.

A project was funded by the European Union to commercialize rock cod (Brickle et al. 2005), and subsequent market development and redistribution of effort led to a 30 -fold
increase in catch rates of rock cod in the Falkland Islands fishery (Laptikhovsky et al. 2013). Rock cod catches are normally processed into headed and gutted frozen product. The flesh is white, with a firm, elastic texture and high nutritional value for human consumption (Gonzalez et al., 2007). Rock cod was never commercially reported before 2003, suggesting that this species comprised the bulk of 'other' catches in those years. Between 2006 and 2015 rock cod was the largest quantity of finfish catch in Falkland Islands fisheries, but has since decreased substantially (Figure 1). In a pattern commonly seen in other fisheries (Pauly et al. 1998), the increased use of rock cod had coincided with catch decreases of higher-value species. In 2015, the minimum cod end mesh size for finfish trawls was increased to 110 mm , largely as a measure to mitigate capture of undersized rock cod (Roux and Winter 2013).

## Methods

In 2020 , rock cod was included in the Falkland Islands Government finfish stock assessment and management review conducted by MacAlister Elliott \& Partners Ltd, UK (MEP 2020). The MEP report recommended stock assessments for most commercial finfish species to be based on the ICES advice rules (ICES 2012, 2018a), referencing applicable categories of data availability and quality. Rock cod was advised at category 3, as a species for which surveybased assessments provide reliable indications of trends in stock metrics, such as total mortality, recruitment, and biomass (ICES 2018a). Additionally, MEP (2020) recommended that the rock cod category 3 assessment should be supported by a length-distribution method such as the length-based indicator (LBI) (ICES 2015).

## Category 3

For category 3 the common assessment method uses a $2 / 3$ rule, in which next year's advised total allowable catch (TAC) is based on trends in the most recent five years of the index. By this rule, a ratio of the mean of the last two years over the mean of the first three years' index of the five-year series is multiplied against last year's advice to generate this year's advice (MEP 2020). If implemented for the first time (i.e., there is no 'last year'), the rule needs to be instigated by a different criterion, such as category 5 : average catches from the last 3 years (MEP 2020). Year-to-year change is further limited to an 'uncertainty cap' of $\pm 20 \%$ (ICES 2018a).

The program of parallel February groundfish and calamari pre-season surveys has been run continuously in all years starting 2015, to 2020 (Ramos and Winter 2020). Accordingly the $2 / 3$ rule could be applied for the first time for 2020 as:

$$
\text { TAC-3 } 3_{2020} \quad=\quad \mathrm{TAC}-5_{2019} \times \frac{\overline{\text { Surveys }_{2018} \text { to } 2019}}{\overline{\text { Surveys }_{2015} \text { to } 2017}},
$$

where:
TAC-52019 $=\quad \overline{\text { Catches }_{2016} \text { to } 2018}$,
then:

$$
\text { TAC-3 } 3_{2022} \quad=\quad \text { TAC- } 3_{2020} \times \frac{\overline{\text { Surveys }_{2019} \text { to } 2020}}{\overline{\text { Surveys }_{2016} \text { to } 2018}} .
$$

Note that the year now jumps from 2020 to 2022. Standard procedure is to inform next year's allowable catch with data up to the last completed year, i.e., the previous year, as licencing advice must be issued while the current year is still in progress.

## LBI

ICES $(2015,2018 b)$ recommends the LBI method which provides a suite of indicators based on combinations of catch-at-size distributions, life-history parameters $\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{Inf}}$; the asymptotic average maximum body size (Haddon 2001), and $\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{Mat}}$ t the length at $50 \%$ maturity (Cope and Punt 2009). $\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{Inf}}$ and $\mathrm{L}_{\text {Mat }}$ parameters were assessed for males and females separately as rock cod growth and maturation are sexually dimorphic (Brickle et al. 2006a, 2006b). The proportions of females in each year's length-frequency samples were also examined.
$\mathrm{L}_{\text {Inf }}$ was calculated from the von Bertalanffy growth function, modelled to rock cod length and age data from the FIFD database with nonlinear least-squares fitting in R package 'fishmethods' (Nelson 2015). Variability of $\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{Inf}}$ and the other von Bertalanffy parameters was estimated by bootstrapping. Residuals of the von Bertalanffy model fit were randomly resampled with replacement, added back to the expected lengths; these newly generated data were re-fit to the von Bertalanffy function, and the $95 \%$ quantiles of 10,000 iterations retained as confidence intervals. Calculations were restricted to rock cod length and age data since 2014, as these data are considered reliable (Lee et al. 2018). Currently the most recent year of available length and age data is 2017, thus four years. Likelihood ratio tests with permutation analysis (Mooij et al. 1999) were run to examine whether $\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{Inf}}$ of individual years were significantly different compared to all years pooled ${ }^{\text {a }}$. If individual years were different, the linear regression was computed ${ }^{\mathrm{b}}$, weighted by inverse variance of each year's von Bertalanffy function (Marín-Martínez and Sánchez-Meca 2010), and $\mathrm{L}_{\text {Inf }}$ linear fit values for LBI parameterization were assigned from the closest year of the data set (i.e., years $<2014$ took the 2014 value, years $>2017$ took the 2017 value). If individual years were not different, combined $\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{Inf}}$ of the four years were used.
$\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{Mat}}$ was calculated as the mid-point of the binomial logistic regression of maturity vs. length (Heino et al. 2002). Gonadal maturity is cyclical as fish pass through pre- to postspawning phases, and definitive maturity assignments can only be made that stages 1 are always juvenile and stages 3 are always adult (B. Lee, FIFD, personal communication). Therefore, maturity assignment was simplified to a dichotomous classification of juvenile (0 1) or adult ( $3+$ ), omitting stage 2 . Rock cod maturities were taken sporadically by FIFD observers starting in 1995, and consistently from 2002. The aggregates of $50 \%$ adulthood lengths were plotted against years and trends calculated with LOESS smooths (degree $=2$, span $=0.90$ ), also weighted by inverse variance of each year's binomial logistic regression. Previous assessments (e.g., Winter 2020) had shown these trends to be significant and the LOESS fits per year were used for LBI parameterization.

LBI method indicators were applied to all years from which observer length measurements of rock cod were available and reported as random samples ${ }^{\text {c }}$ : years 2002 to 2020. Because finfish trawls are restricted to larger meshes than calamari trawls, only

[^0]observer length measurements taken in finfish-licensed fisheries were used ${ }^{\mathrm{d}}$, to avoid biasing length-frequency distributions if proportionally more samples are recorded from one fishery or another in different years. The procedure for identifying finfish-licensed observer samples is described in Appendix 1. LBI method indicators were then selected and scored using Tables 2.1.1.4.1 and 2.1.2.2 in ICES (2015) as templates:

1) Length at half the modal catch length ${ }^{\mathrm{e}}$ should be bigger than length at $50 \%$ maturity, for conservation of immature fish ( $\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}} / \mathrm{L}_{\text {Mat }}>1$ ).
2) Length at cumulative $25^{\text {th }}$ percentile of catch numbers should be bigger than length at $50 \%$ maturity, for conservation of immature fish ( $\mathrm{L}_{25 \%} / \mathrm{L}_{\text {Mat }}>1$ ).
3) Mean length of the largest $5 \%$ of individuals in the catch should be at least $80 \%$ of the asymptotic length, as a benchmark that enough large individuals are in the stock ( $\mathrm{L}_{\text {max5 }} / \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{Inf}}>0.8$ ).
4) 'Mega-spawners' should comprise at least $30 \%$ of the catch (thus implicitly represent at least $30 \%$ of the stock), as large, old fish disproportionately benefit the resilience of the population (Froese 2004) ( $\mathrm{P}_{\text {mega }}>0.3$ ).
Mega-spawners are defined as individuals larger than optimum length ( $\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{opt}}$ ) $+10 \%$, where $\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{Opt}}$ itself is described as the length at which growth rate is maximum (ICES 2015), or the length at which total biomass of a year-class reaches its maximum value (Froese and Binohlan 2000). $\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{Opt}}=3 \cdot \mathrm{~L}_{\mathrm{Inf}} \cdot\left(3+\mathrm{MK}^{-1}\right)^{-1}$ (Beverton 1992), where M is instantaneous natural mortality, K is the rate of curvature of the von Bertalanffy growth function, and the ratio $\mathrm{MK}^{-1}$ is set in WKLIFE V software (ICES 2015) at the standard constant of 1.5 (Jensen 1996).
5) Mean length of individuals larger than $L_{C}$ ( $\mathrm{L}_{\text {meanc }}$ ) should be approximately equal to $L_{\text {Opt }}$, for optimal yield $\left(L_{\text {meanc }} / L_{\text {Opt }} \approx 1\right)$.
6) $\mathrm{L}_{\text {meanc }}$ should be equal or bigger to the length-based proxy for MSY ( $\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{F}=\mathrm{M}}$ ), for producing maximum sustainable yield ( $\mathrm{L}_{\text {meanc }} / \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{F}=\mathrm{M}} \geq 1$ ).
$\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{F}=\mathrm{M}}$ implements the premise that MSY is attained when fishing mortality equals natural mortality (Froese et al. 2018), and in WKLIFE V software (ICES 2015) is computed as $\left(3 \cdot \mathrm{~L}_{\mathrm{C}}+\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{Inf}}\right) / 4$.

Margins of variability of the six indicators were estimated by randomly re-sampling $30,000 \times$ on the normal distribution each year's fit of $\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{Inf}}$ to the linear regression and $\mathrm{L}_{\text {Mat }}$ to the LOESS smooth. Indicators were scored against the 'traffic light' scale (ICES 2015) with reference criteria $>1,>0.8$, and $>0.3$ green if the lower $95 \%$ quantile of the re-sampled iterations was $>1,>0.8$, and $>0.3$, yellow if $1,0.8$, and 0.3 were between the lower and upper $95 \%$ quantiles, and red if the upper $95 \%$ quantile of the re-sampled iterations was $<1,<0.8$, and $<0.3^{\mathrm{f}}$. Reference criterion $\approx 1$ was green if the lower and upper $95 \%$ quantiles spanned 1 , yellow if the lower and upper $95 \%$ quantiles spanned 0.9 without spanning 1 (cf. ICES 2015), and red otherwise. Reference criterion $\geq 1$ was scored the same as $>1$, except that empirical values $\geq 1$ were automatically green.

[^1]
## Results

## Catches

During 2020 a total of 807.0 tonnes rock cod were caught in the Falkland Islands zone; the lowest total since the start of consistent commercial reporting in 2005 (Figure 1). Compared to last year (Winter 2020), rock cod catches decreased more than four-fold in the A- and Glicence finfish trawl fisheries, but nearly doubled in the X-licence calamari fishery (Table 1). Among finfish target licences, of 748 A-licence catch reports in 2020, rock cod was the thirdhighest catch species on 7 catch reports. Of 506 G-licence catch reports in 2020, rock cod was the second-highest catch species on 3 catch reports. And of 735 W -licence catch reports in 2020 , rock cod was the highest catch species on 8 and the second-highest on 25 catch reports.

Table 1. Falkland Islands rock cod catches by licence in 2019.

| Licence | Rock cod catch <br> (Tonnes) | $\%$ |  |
| :---: | :--- | :---: | ---: |
| Code | Type | 18.8 | 2.3 |
| A | Unrestricted finfish | 42.2 | 5.2 |
| G | Restricted finfish + Illex | 254.7 | 31.6 |
| W | Restricted finfish | 2.8 | 0.3 |
| F | Skate | 261.7 | 32.4 |
| C | Calamari 1 ${ }^{\text {st }}$ season | 145.3 | 18.0 |
| X | Calamari 2 ${ }^{\text {nd }}$ | season | 0.9 |
| B | Illex squid | 0.0 | 0.1 |
| S | Surimi | 0.0 | 0.0 |
| L | Toothfish longline | 11.0 | 1.4 |
| E | Experimental | 69.6 | 8.6 |
| O | Out-of-zone | 807.0 | 100.0 |
| Total |  |  |  |

## Category 3

Annual commercial rock cod catches, corresponding to Figure 1 are summarized in Table A1. Only 'in-zone' catches are used as these catches represent license-allocated fishing effort. Based on the in-zone catches:

TAC-5 $5_{2019}=\overline{\text { Catches }_{2016 \text { to } 2018}}=\overline{6895.3,2422.0,2146.3}=3821.2$ tonnes.
Together with the survey data in Table III of Ramos and Winter (2020):
$\begin{aligned} \text { TAC- } 3_{2020} & =\mathrm{TAC}-5_{2019} \times \frac{\overline{\text { Surveys }_{2018} \text { to } 2019}}{\overline{\text { Surveys }_{2015} \text { to } 2017}} \\ & =3821.2 \times \frac{\overline{\overline{87595.83,377793.3}}}{\overline{352570.42,235339.08,138641.20}} \quad=989.2 \text { tonnes } .\end{aligned}$
Pursuant to the $\pm 20 \%$ uncertainty cap:

TAC-3 $3_{2020}=$ TAC- $52019-20 \% \times$ TAC- $5_{2019}=3821.2 \times 0.80=3057.0$ tonnes.
$\begin{aligned} \mathrm{TAC}-3_{2022} & =\mathrm{TAC}-3_{2020} \times \frac{\overline{\overline{\text { Surveys }_{2019} \text { to } 2020}}}{\overline{\text { Surveys }_{2016 \text { to } 2018}}} \\ & =3057.0 \times \frac{\overline{377793.3,22335.25}}{235339.08,138641.20,87595.83}\end{aligned}$
Pursuant to the $\pm 20 \%$ uncertainty cap:
$\mathrm{TAC}-3_{2022}=\mathrm{TAC}-3_{2020}-20 \% \times \mathrm{TAC}-3_{2020}=3057.0 \times 0.80=2445.6$ tonnes.
However, TAC-3 $3_{2022}$ is conspicuously higher than the 3 -year catch average (TAC-5 ${ }_{2022}$ ) which, given that rock cod survey biomass is still on a declining trend (Ramos and Winter 2020), may be considered as a conservative alternative:

TAC-5 $5_{2022}=\overline{\text { Catches }_{2018 \text { to } 2020}}=\overline{2146.3,925.2,726.4} \quad=1266.0$ tonnes.
Again, note the two-year jump from 2020 to 2022.

## LBI

$\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{Inf}}$ of the years 2014 - 2017 were significantly different ( $\mathrm{p}<0.001$ ) by likelihood ratio, for both males and females. Yearly von Bertalanffy parameters are summarized in Table A2. Accordingly, $\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{inf}}$ for LBI parameterization was set to the linear trends. Despite only four data, the decreasing trend was marginally significant ( $p<0.06$ ) for females (Figure 2). $L_{\text {Mat }}$ between years 1995 and 2020 showed significantly decreasing trends from approximately 2005 for both males and females (Figure 3).

Figure 2 [below]. Asymptotic lengths ( $\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{lnf}}$ ) calculated according to the von Bertalanffy growth function for male (top) and female (bottom) rock cod, in years 2014 to 2017. Grey lines are linear regressions $\pm 95 \%$ confidence intervals.



Figure 3 [below]. Lengths at $50 \%$ adulthood of male (top) and female (bottom) rock cod, 1995 to 2020. Grey lines are LOESS smooths $\pm 95 \%$ confidence intervals. Yearly data correspond to the 0.5 length intercepts in Figure A1.


A total of 348,157 rock cod lengths were randomly sampled in finfish trawls between 2002 and 2020; 165,001 male and 183,156 female. Resultant 'traffic light' scores for LBI method indicators are summarized in Tables 2 and 3.

Year 2002 can be discounted, as only 6 male and 11 female rock cod lengths were randomly sampled, at one station. Among years 2003 to 2020, indicator $\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}} / \mathrm{L}_{\text {Mat }}$ appeared to fluctuate haphazardly, and may be inconsistent due to irregular length-frequency modes (Figure A2). $\mathrm{L}_{25 \%} / \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{Mat}}$, the other indicator for conservation of immature fish, showed a pattern of generally more successful outcomes in the range of years that had the highest catches of rock cod (2007 to 2014; Figure 1), whereby for males most of these years were yellow (around one, Table 2), and for females most of these years were green (greater than one, Table 3). Indicator $\mathrm{L}_{\text {max } 5 \%} / \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{Inf}}$, for the conservation of large individuals, was consistently yellow for males and half yellow half green for females, with the five most recent years green. Indicator $\mathrm{P}_{\text {mega }}$, for the presence of mega-spawners, was almost all yellow for males until 2015, the year when catches started to decline strongly (Figure 1), although only in 2008 the empirical proportion was above the threshold of 0.3 (Table 2). For females, $\mathrm{P}_{\text {mega }}$ has been constantly red (Table 3). $\mathrm{L}_{\text {meanc }} / \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{Opt}}$, the indicator for optimal yield, was green for males until 2014, the last year of very high rock cod catches, and mostly yellow for females. Both males and females were yellow in the most recent year 2020. $\mathrm{L}_{\text {meanc }} / \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{F}=\mathrm{M}}$, the indicator for maximum sustainable yield, was also mostly green for males, and for females, mostly green except the four-year period from 2011 to 2014 ; roughly the end range of the period of high rock cod catches (Figure 1).

Table 2. Male rock cod indicators by year, with 'traffic light' scoring.

|  | Conservation |  |  |  | Optim. Yield | MSY |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Ref. | $\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}} / \mathrm{L}_{\text {Mat }}$ | $\mathrm{L}_{25 \%} / \mathrm{L}_{\text {Mat }}$ | $\mathrm{L}_{\text {max5\% }} / \mathrm{L}_{\text {Inf }}$ | $\mathrm{P}_{\text {mega }}$ | $\mathrm{L}_{\text {meanc }} / \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{Opt}}$ | $\mathrm{L}_{\text {meanc }} / \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{F}=\mathrm{M}}$ |
| 2002 | 0.68 | $>1$ | $>0.8$ | $>0.3$ | $\approx 1$ | $\geq 1$ |
| 2003 | 0.91 | 0.92 | 0.56 | 0.00 | 0.72 | 0.86 |
| 2004 | 0.82 | 0.86 | 0.82 | 0.10 | 0.98 | 0.98 |
| 2005 | 0.86 | 0.90 | 0.81 | 0.11 | 0.97 | 1.02 |
| 2006 | 0.78 | 0.90 | 0.84 | 0.20 | 1.02 | 1.04 |
| 2007 | 0.95 | 0.99 | 0.85 | 0.16 | 0.97 | 1.05 |
| 2008 | 1.00 | 1.04 | 0.86 | 0.18 | 1.03 | 1.00 |
| 2009 | 0.82 | 0.90 | 0.86 | 0.33 | 1.08 | 1.02 |
| 2010 | 0.84 | 0.88 | 0.85 | 0.22 | 0.97 | 1.06 |
| 2011 | 0.95 | 0.99 | 0.82 | 0.09 | 0.95 | 1.03 |
| 2012 | 0.98 | 1.03 | 0.83 | 0.14 | 0.97 | 0.99 |
| 2013 | 0.88 | 0.97 | 0.80 | 0.08 | 0.99 | 1.01 |
| 2014 | 1.09 | 0.99 | 0.79 | 0.05 | 0.90 | 1.01 |
| 2015 | 0.63 | 0.77 | 0.82 | 0.9 | 0.98 | 0.97 |
| 2016 | 0.89 | 0.94 | 0.82 | 0.08 | 0.86 | 1.17 |
| 2017 | 0.65 | 0.75 | 0.78 | 0.05 | 0.87 | 0.99 |
| 2018 | 0.91 | 0.91 | 0.80 | 0.07 | 0.75 | 1.01 |
| 2019 | 0.71 | 0.91 | 0.81 | 0.08 | 0.88 | 0.98 |
| 2020 | 0.71 | 0.86 | 0.82 | 0.08 | 0.84 | 1.08 |

Table 3. Female rock cod indicators by year, with 'traffic light' scoring.

|  | Conservation |  |  |  | Optim. Yield | MSY |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Ref. | $\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}} / \mathrm{L}_{\text {Mat }}$ | $\mathrm{L}_{25 \%} / \mathrm{L}_{\text {Mat }}$ | $\mathrm{L}_{\text {max5\% }} / \mathrm{L}_{\text {Inf }}$ | $\mathrm{P}_{\text {mega }}$ | $\mathrm{L}_{\text {meanc }} / \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{Opt}}$ | $\mathrm{L}_{\text {meanc }} / \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{F}=\mathrm{M}}$ |
| 2002 | 0.74 | 0.79 | 0.8 | $>0.3$ | $\approx 1$ | $\geq 1$ |
| 2003 | 0.96 | 1.00 | 0.53 | 0.00 | 0.66 | 0.84 |
| 2004 | 0.85 | 0.94 | 0.78 | 0.04 | 0.88 | 0.96 |
| 2005 | 1.02 | 1.02 | 0.79 | 0.06 | 0.89 | 1.03 |
| 2006 | 0.84 | 0.97 | 0.80 | 0.12 | 0.97 | 0.99 |
| 2007 | 0.97 | 1.06 | 0.81 | 0.14 | 0.91 | 1.05 |
| 2008 | 1.07 | 1.16 | 0.84 | 0.21 | 0.95 | 1.01 |
| 2009 | 0.91 | 1.00 | 0.84 | 0.17 | 0.01 | 1.01 |
| 2010 | 0.92 | 1.01 | 0.83 | 0.09 | 0.93 | 1.03 |
| 2011 | 1.04 | 1.08 | 0.78 | 0.05 | 0.90 | 1.01 |
| 2012 | 1.06 | 1.11 | 0.78 | 0.06 | 0.92 | 0.97 |
| 2013 | 0.94 | 1.04 | 0.77 | 0.06 | 0.86 | 0.97 |
| 2014 | 1.16 | 1.11 | 0.75 | 0.03 | 0.93 | 0.99 |
| 2015 | 0.67 | 0.93 | 0.81 | 0.13 | 0.98 | 1.21 |
| 2016 | 0.94 | 1.00 | 0.86 | 0.15 | 0.91 | 1.02 |
| 2017 | 0.69 | 0.85 | 0.87 | 0.11 | 0.86 | 1.12 |
| 2018 | 1.03 | 1.03 | 0.87 | 0.11 | 0.96 | 1.00 |
| 2019 | 0.93 | 1.04 | 0.87 | 0.13 | 0.96 | 1.07 |
| 2020 | 0.82 | 0.93 | 0.89 | 0.15 | 0.90 | 1.08 |

## Conclusion

Length-based indicators (LBI) showed mixed results (Tables 2 and 3) in parallel with the trends of low catches and low survey indices. Traffic-light scores indicated that immature rock cod are not well protected - especially males, while large rock cod are protected especially females, but very large rock cod are again not protected. Median rock cod lengths sampled in finfish-licensed fisheries have been significantly decreasing over the years (Figure 4), while length-frequency distribution spreads; the ranges between, e.g., the $25^{\text {th }}$ quantile and the $75^{\text {th }}$ quantile of lengths, have not varied significantly (Figure 5), thus size distributions have not become more truncated. MSY indicators showing strong (green) in recent years, despite decreasing lengths, imply that rock cod are maintaining productivity at smaller sizes, as well as maturity at smaller sizes (Figure 3). Contrary to the high $\mathrm{L}_{\text {max } 5 \%} / \mathrm{L}_{\text {Inf }}$ scores, these trends indicate that large rock cod are not protected.

The ambiguity of these signals invites caution about rock cod length distributions. The LBI method assumes equilibrium conditions (ICES 2018b), which would usually represent as annual length modes progressing in fairly regular order left to right (e.g., Gulland and Rosenberg 1992). However, recent years of the finfish-licenced rock cod length distributions have been irregular (Figure A2; since 2015), suggesting that as rock cod declined to a commercial bycatch, different parts of the stock may have been sampled haphazardly depending on the primary target catch.

Figure 4 [below]. Median lengths in finfish-licenced observer samples of male (top) and female (bottom) rock cod, 2002 to 2020. Grey lines are LOESS smooths $\pm 95 \%$ confidence intervals. Yearly data correspond to Figure A2.


Figure 5 [below]. 25\% to $75 \%$ quantile length spreads in finfish-licenced observer samples of male (top) and female (bottom) rock cod, 2002 to 2020. Grey lines are LOESS smooths $\pm 95 \%$ confidence intervals. Yearly data correspond to Figure A2.



Alternatively, male and female components of the stock may have been affected differently. Several of the traffic light scores showed distinct outcomes for males and females (Tables 2 and 3), and a slight but statistically significant trend was found in sex proportions from 2002 to 2020 (Figure 6). The proportion of females decreased until about 2008/2009, steadied between 2009 and 2011/2012 - the period of highest average rock cod catches - then decreased again after 2012 until about 2016. Males and females exhibit dissimilar behaviours such as spawning territoriality (Arkhipkin et al. 2013), and if conditions change to make one sex or the other more vulnerable the entire stock may be impacted.


Figure 6 [previous page]. LOESS trend of average female proportion in finfish-licensed rock cod samples, 2002 to 2020 . Circles $(\mathrm{N}=3532)$ are individual observer stations.

The LBI results were thus not definitive, but together with the low catches and low survey indices point to the continuing need for conservative management of the rock cod stock. The trajectory of Falkland Islands rock cod catches also parallels that of Argentina (Table A3).

TAC $-5_{2022}=1266.0$ tonnes is equivalent to $2.15 \%$ of total Falkland Islands-licenced finfish catch taken in 2020, but higher than any annual rock cod catch total since 2018 (Table A1). Thus TAC- $5_{2022}$ fulfils the requirement of a conservative catch limit, but without undue risk of 'choking' other fishery targets.

## References

Arkhipkin, A., Brickle. P., Laptikhovsky, V. 2003. Variation in the diet of the Patagonian toothfish, Dissostichus eleginoides (Perciformes: Nototheniidae), with size, depth and season around the Falkland Islands (Southwest Atlantic). Journal of Fish Biology 63: 428-441.

Arkhipkin, A., Brickle, P., Laptikhovsky, V., Winter, A. 2012. Dining hall at sea: feeding migrations of nektonic predators to the eastern Patagonian Shelf. Journal of Fish Biology 81: 882-902.

Arkhipkin, A., Jürgens, E., Howes, P.N. 2013. Spawning, egg development and early ontogenesis in rock cod Patagonotothen ramsayi (Regan, 1913) caught on the Patagonian Shelf and maintained in captivity. Polar Biology 36: 1195-1204.

Beverton, R.J.H. 1992. Patterns of reproductive strategy parameters in some marine teleost fishes. Journal of Fish Biology 41: 137-160.

Brickle, P., Laptikhovsky, V., Pompert, J., Bishop, A. 2003. Ontogenetic changes in the feeding habits and dietary overlap between three abundant rajid species on the Falkland Islands' shelf. Journal of the Marine Biological Association of the UK 83: 1119-1125.

Brickle, P., Shcherbich, Z., Laptikhovsky, V., Arkhipkin, A. 2005. Scientific Report. Aspects of the biology of the Falkland Islands rockcod Patagonotothen ramsayi (Regan, 1913) on the southern Patagonian shelf. Directorate of Natural Resources, FIG, Stanley, 81 p.

Brickle, P., Laptikhovsky, V., Arkhipkin, A., Portela, J. 2006a. Reproductive biology of Patagonotothen ramsayi (Regan, 1913) (Pisces: Nototheniidae) around the Falkland Islands. Polar Biology 29: 570-580.

Brickle, P., Arkhipkin, A., Shcherbich, Z. 2006b. Age and growth of a sub-Antarctic notothenioid, Patagonotothen ramsayi (Regan 1913), from the Falkland Islands. Polar Biology 29: 633-639.

Cope, J.M., Punt, A.E. 2009. Length-based reference points for data-limited situations: Applications and restrictions. Marine and Coastal Fisheries: Dynamics, Management, and Ecosystem Science 1: 169-186.

Cousseau, M.B., Perrotta, R.G. 2000. Peces mainos de Argentina. Biología, distribución, pesca. INIDEP. Mar del Plata, Argentina. 167 p.

Froese, R. 2004. Keep it simple: three indicators to deal with overfishing. Fish and Fisheries 5: 86-91.

Froese, R., Binohlan, C. 2000. Empirical relationships to estimate asymptotic length, length at first maturity and length at maximum yield per recruit in fishes, with a simple method to evaluate length frequency data. Journal of Fish Biology 56: 758-773.

Froese, R., Winker, H., Coro, G., Demirel, N., Tsikliras, A.C., Dimarchopoulou, D., Scarcella, G., Probst, W.N., Dureuil, M., Pauly, D. 2018. A new approach for estimating stock status from length frequency data. ICES Journal of Marine Science 75: 2004-2015.

Gonzalez, M.J., Gallardo, J.M., Brickle, P., Medina, I. 2007. Nutritional composition and safety of Patagonotothen ramsayi, a discard species from Patagonian shelf. International Journal of Food Science and Technology 42:1240-1248.

Gulland, J.A., Rosenberg, A.A. 1992. A review of length-based approaches to assessing fish stocks. FAO Fisheries Technical Paper. No. 323. Rome, FAO. 100p.

Haddon, M. 2001. Modelling and quantitative methods in fisheries. Chapman \& Hall/CRC, Boca Raton, Florida. 406 pp.

Heino, M., Dieckmann, U., Godø, O.R. 2002. Measuring probabilistic reaction norms for age and size at maturation. Evolution 56: 669-678.

ICES. 2012. ICES Implementation of Advice for Data limited Stocks in its 2012 Advice. http://www.ices.dk/sites/pub/Publication\ Reports/Expert\ Group\ Report/acom/2012/A DHOC/DLS\%20Guidance\%20Report\%202012.pdf

ICES. 2015. Report of the Fifth Workshop on the Development of Quantitative Assessment Methodologies based on Life-history Traits, Exploitation Characteristics and other Relevant Parameters for Data-limited Stocks (WKLIFE V), 5-9 October 2015, Lisbon, Portugal. ICES CM 2015/ACOM: 56. 157 p.

ICES. 2018a. General context of ICES advice.
https://www.ices.dk/sites/pub/Publication\ Reports/Advice/2018/2018/Introduction_to advice 2018.pdf

ICES. 2018b. ICES technical guidelines. ICES reference points for stocks in categories 3 and 4 . http://www.ices.dk/sites/pub/Publication\ Reports/Guidelines\ and\ Policies/16.04.03.02 Category 3-4 Reference Points.pdf

Jensen, A.L. 1996. Beverton and Holt life history invariants result from optimal trade-off of reproduction and survival. Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences 53: 820-822.

La Mesa M., Riginella E., Melli V., Bartolini F., Mazzoldi C. 2016. Biological traits of a subAntarctic nototheniid, Patagonotothen ramsayi, from the Burdwood Bank. Polar Biology 39: 103111.

Laptikhovsky, V., Arkhipkin, A. 2003. An impact of seasonal squid migrations and fishing on the feeding spectra of subantarctic notothenioids Patagonotothen ramsayi and Cottoperca gobio around the Falkland Islands. Journal of Applied Ichthyology 19: 35-39.

Laptikhovsky, V., Arkhipkin, A., Brickle, P. 2013. From small bycatch to main commercial species: Explosion of stocks of rock cod Patagonotothen ramsayi (Regan) in the Southwest Atlantic. Fisheries Research 147: 399-403.

Lee, B., Shcherbich, Z., Randhawa, H. 2018. Age validation for rock cod (Patagonotothen ramsayi) sampled in the Falkland Islands: A comparison of age estimates. Technical Document, FIG Fisheries Department. 5 p .

Marín-Martínez, F., Sánchez-Meca, J. 2010. Weighting by inverse variance or by sample size in random-effects meta-analysis. Educational and Psychological Measurement 70: 56-73

MEP. 2020. Review of Falkland Islands finfish fisheries. Final Report - in preparation.
Mooij, W.M., Van Rooij, J.M., Wijnhoven, S. 1999. Analysis and comparison of fish growth from small samples of length-at-age data: detection of sexual dimorphism in Eurasian Perch as an example. Transactions of the American Fisheries Society 128: 483-490.

Navarro, G., Rozycki, V., Monsalvo, M. 2014. Estadísticas de la pesca marina en la Argentina. Evolución de los desembarques 2008-2013. Ministerio de Agricultura, Ganaderia y Pesca de la Nación. Buenos Aires, 144 p.

Navarro, G., Rozycki, V., Monsalvo, M. 2019. Estadísticas de la pesca marina en Argentina. Evolución de los desembarques 2012-2016. Secretaria de Gobierno de Agroindustria, 147 p.

Nelson, G.A. 2015. Package 'fishmethods': Fishery science methods and models from published literature and contributions from colleagues. R package version 1.9-0.

Nyegaard, M., Arkhipkin, A., Brickle, P. 2004. An alternating discard scavenger: variation in the diet of kingclip, Genypterus blacodes (Ophididae) around the Falkland Islands. Journal of Fish Biology 65: 666-682.

Pauly, D., Christensen, V., Dalsgaard, J., Froese, R., Torres, F. Jr. 1998. Fishing down marine food webs. Science 279:860-863.

Ramos, J.E., Winter, A. 2020. February trawl survey biomasses of fishery species in Falkland Islands waters, 2010-2020. SA-2020-04. Technical Document, FIG Fisheries Department. 58 p.

Roux, M.-J., Winter, A. 2013. Performance evaluation of modifications to trawl fishing gear for reducing by-catch of undersized rock cod Patagonotothen ramsayi in finfish fisheries. Technical Document, FIG Fisheries Department. 55 p.

Sánchez, R., Navarro, G., Rozycki, V. 2012. Estadísticas de la pesca marina en la Argentina. Evolución de los desembarques 1898-2010. Ministerio de Agricultura, Ganaderia y Pesca de la Nación. Buenos Aires, 528 p.

Winter, A., Zawadowski, T., Tutjavi, V. 2019. Doryteuthis gahi stock assessment survey, $1^{\text {st }}$ season 2019. Technical Document, FIG Fisheries Department. 18 p.

Winter, A. 2020, Rock cod Patagonotothen ramsayi stock assessment. Technical Document, FIG Fisheries Department. 33 p.

## Appendix

## A1. Identifying finfish-licenced observer samples.

The FIFD observer database identifies samples by vessel, date, activity (fishing gear type), and observer station, but does not directly link to the licence that the vessel was operating under. If required, the licence must be cross-referenced from the catch report. In most cases, a catch report is recorded the same day by the same vessel, and the corresponding licence can be applied to the samples directly. In some cases however, a catch report is not recorded the same day and instead the nearest catch report by the same vessel either up to 3 days later or 1 day earlier is applied ${ }^{\text {g }}$ (which still does not result in all samples getting matched).

Among positive licence matches, finfish trawl samples are those with activity codes B (bottom trawl), P (pelagic trawl) or S (semi-pelagic trawl), and licence codes $\mathrm{A} / \mathrm{Y}$ (unrestricted finfish), G (Illex + restricted finfish), W/Z (restricted finfish), and S (surimi). Licence code E (experimental) may be any gear or catch target, and can therefore only be matched as finfish by checking against a survey report for that date range or, more expediently, evaluating the species composition that was caught. For this assessment, the criteria were used that a trawl E licence target was designated Illex if Illex comprised $>50 \%$ of the catch within 1 day earlier and three days later, skate if skate comprised $>50 \%$ of the catch within 1 day earlier and three days later, and calamari if calamari comprised $>25 \%$ of the catch within 1 day earlier and three days later. Otherwise finfish. The lower threshold for calamari reflected the outcome that calamari catch is often scarce in early days of pre-season surveys (e.g., Winter et al. 2019). As criteria of $>50 \%$ Illex / skate vs. $>25 \%$ calamari are non-exclusive, the additional rule was set that a catch composition was designated to that target which exceeded its threshold by the highest proportion. Finfish-designated E licence samples were then added to the commercial licence finfish samples.

[^2]Table A1. Falkland Islands commercial rock cod catches (excluding E licences) by year. Equivalent to the rock cod (out) and rock cod (in) bars in Figure 1, but restricted to the first year (1992) that any rock cod catch was reported.

| Year | Rock cod catch (tonnes) |  | Year | Rock cod catch (tonnes) |  |
| :---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
|  | Out-of-zone | In-zone |  | Out-of-zone | In-zone |
| 1992 | 0.0 | 0.7 | 2007 | 35.1 | 30843.4 |
| 1993 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 2008 | 361.4 | 60162.9 |
| 1994 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 2009 | 806.4 | 57993.5 |
| 1995 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 2010 | 1019.9 | 76146.4 |
| 1996 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 2011 | 710.8 | 55272.6 |
| 1997 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 2012 | 611.0 | 63114.8 |
| 1998 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 2013 | 2020.2 | 31952.6 |
| 1999 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 2014 | 6809.9 | 56134.3 |
| 2000 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 2015 | 933.3 | 28537.7 |
| 2001 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 2016 | 6448.4 | 6895.3 |
| 2002 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 2017 | 5496.9 | 2422.0 |
| 2003 | 0.0 | 2.4 | 2018 | 2088.1 | 2146.3 |
| 2004 | 0.0 | 176.1 | 2019 | 26.7 | 925.2 |
| 2005 | 0.0 | 9043.7 | 2020 | 69.6 | 726.4 |
| 2006 | 0.0 | 24616.3 |  |  |  |

Table A2. Rock cod von Bertalanffy length-at-age parameters, by year and sex, and 95\% confidence intervals of $\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{Inf}}$ (in cm ).

| Sex | Year | N | k | $\mathrm{t}_{0}$ |  | $\mathrm{~L}_{\text {Inf }}$ |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| M | 2014 | 85 | 0.206 | -0.870 | 40.4 | $(36.5-46.4)$ |
|  | 2015 | 175 | 0.297 | -0.497 | 38.5 | $(36.5-40.8)$ |
|  | 2016 | 167 | 0.199 | -1.260 | 41.5 | $(36.8-49.9)$ |
|  | 2017 | 72 | 0.325 | -0.238 | 34.7 | $(32.1-38.0)$ |
|  | 2014 | 104 | 0.189 | -0.771 | 43.4 | $(39.8-49.5)$ |
|  | 2015 | 163 | 0.245 | -0.827 | 40.0 | $(38.2-42.1)$ |
|  | 2016 | 156 | 0.260 | -1.068 | 37.4 | $(35.2-40.2)$ |
|  | 2017 | 83 | 0.250 | -0.479 | 38.1 | $(36.0-40.9)$ |

Table A3. Argentina commercial rock cod ${ }^{\text {h }}$ catches by year, for the same range of years as Table A1. From Sánchez et al. 2012, Navarro et al. 2014, 2019, and the website of the Ministerio de Agricultura, Ganadería y Pescai (Argentina).

| Year | Rock cod catch (tonnes) | Year | Rock cod catch (tonnes) |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| 1992 | 0.0 | 2007 | 8354.8 |
| 1993 | 0.0 | 2008 | 12433.5 |
| 1994 | 0.1 | 2009 | 16645.5 |
| 1995 | 0.0 | 2010 | 9447.8 |
| 1996 | 0.0 | 2011 | 8575.4 |
| 1997 | 0.0 | 2012 | 7936.8 |
| 1998 | 0.0 | 2013 | 6517.9 |
| 1999 | 0.0 | 2014 | 6850.5 |
| 2000 | 0.2 | 2015 | 4273.1 |
| 2001 | 182.8 | 2016 | 909.5 |
| 2002 | 179.6 | 2017 | 1972.1 |
| 2003 | 258.8 | 2018 | 809.0 |
| 2004 | 468.7 | 2019 | 87.8 |
| 2005 | 4169.7 | 2020 | 101.8 |
| 2006 | 9842.2 |  |  |

[^3]






Figure A1. Binomial logistic regressions of juvenile (0) or adult (1) maturity vs. length. The regressions are omitted from data sets that were insufficient or failed to converge on plausible values. Grey bars: distributions scaled to sample numbers. Red lines: Length intercept of $50 \%$ adulthood, corresponding to Figure 3.






Figure A2. Randomly sampled rock cod lengths in finfish trawls. Note that numbers are not equivalent to Figure A1, as Figure A1 may include non-random samples and gear other than finfish trawls. Yearly numbers are summarized in Figures 4 and 5.


[^0]:    ${ }^{\text {a }}$ Intermediate levels of pooling would also be computable, e.g., 2 or 3 consecutive years at a time, but it was not deemed relevant to extend the analysis to that level of resolution.
    ${ }^{\mathrm{b}}$ With just four data the linear regressions had low potential for statistical significance, but this was taken into consideration assigning margins of error to the $\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{Inf}}$ estimates.
    ${ }^{c}$ FIFD database codes R and S.

[^1]:    ${ }^{\text {d }}$ Also excluding skate and Illex trawls. While skate and Illex currently do not have different mesh allowances from finfish, their different targets could also relate to characteristically different length-frequency distributions of rock cod.
    ${ }^{e}$ Note that this parameter may be poorly defined if the catch length-frequency distribution is not smooth and unimodal.
    ${ }^{\mathrm{f}}$ Note that this use of the margins of variability means that same empirical values may be scored different colours in different years.

[^2]:    ${ }^{\mathrm{g}}$ The rationale being that a vessel will file its catch report when it has finished processing the trawl, which may be several days if it is a big haul or the factory is backed up; alternatively the observer might only sample a trawl the day after it was hauled.

[^3]:    ${ }^{\text {h }}$ Reported as Notothenia. While this is ostensibly the family Nototheniidae, not the species, Cousseau and Perrotta (2000) identify Notothenia as Patagonotothen ramsayi.
    ${ }^{\text {i }}$ www.magyp.gob.ar//sitio/areas/pesca maritima/desembarques/

